



BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

**FILED**

08-24-07

04:59 PM

Order Instituting Rulemaking to  
Implement the Commission's  
Procurement Incentive Framework and to  
Examine the Integration of Greenhouse  
Gas Emissions Standards into  
Procurement Policies.

Rulemaking 06-04-009  
(Filed April 13, 2006)

**COMMENTS OF THE DIVISION OF RATEPAYER ADVOCATES  
ON THE PROPOSED INTERIM OPINION ON REPORTING  
AND TRACKING OF GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS  
IN THE ELECTRICITY SECTOR**

**I. INTRODUCTION**

Pursuant to Rules 14.3 and 14.6 of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, the Division of Ratepayer Advocates (DRA) submits these comments on the Proposed Decision "Interim Opinion on Reporting and Tracking of Greenhouse Gas Emissions in the Electricity Sector" (PD).

The PD assumes that the Commission and the California Energy Commission will ultimately recommend to the California Air Resources Board (ARB) either a first-seller approach or a load-based approach for regulating emissions from California's electric sector. However, DRA agrees that the Commission and the CEC should carefully consider whether either of those approaches is in the best interests of California.<sup>1</sup> Further analysis may lead to the conclusion that the legal and regulatory complexities of attempting to regulate emissions from imported power are so daunting that California would be better served by a continued focus on energy efficiency and renewable energy, while at the same time working to establish a regional system of cap and trade.

---

<sup>1</sup> See August 21, 2007 presentation of CPUC Division of Strategic Planning Director Julie Fitch, at <http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/static/energy/electric/climate+change/fitch+-+lb-fs+en+banc.ppt>

## II. DISCUSSION

### A. **DRA supports the PD's recommendations on emissions calculations to ensure that emission reductions are "real," but recommends clarifying the recommendations.**

DRA supports the PD's recommendations that the ARB adjust the reported emissions for each Load Serving Entity (LSE) to minimize contract shuffling and to ensure that emission reductions are "real." The PD describes scenarios under which such adjustments would apply, with conditions for exemption that need to be met on a case-by-case basis. For example, for new power purchase agreements with existing specified sources, ARB will assign the regional default emission factor based on the location of the specified source,<sup>2</sup> unless (i) the Power Purchase Agreement (PPA) was in effect prior to January 1, 2008 and either is still in effect or has been renewed without interruption, or (ii) the purchase is made through a PPA from a power plant that became operational on or after January, 2008.

DRA recommends that the Commission add the following sentence at the end of Section V.B.2(a) at page 21 of the PD: "If these conditions are not met, then the ARB should use the default regional emission factor be used for new power contracts with existing specified sources." In addition, the Commission should clarify the unit of measure for the input fields "Losses" and "Trans Losses" in the Sample Reporting Form at pages A-11 through A-13 as either MWh or percentage. This recommended clarification would ensure input consistency across submitting parties.

### B. **Firming Power for Renewable Resources should not be attributed the same emission characteristics as the contracted renewable power plant.**

The PD would attribute to firming power for renewable resources the same emissions factor as the underlying renewable resource.<sup>3</sup> The purported rationale is that assigning the emissions factor of the renewable resource to the firming power associated with that resource would be consistent with the Commission's treatment of renewable

---

<sup>2</sup> PD, p. 18.

<sup>3</sup> PD, p. 22.

power and firming resources in D.07-01-039, which established the Emissions Performance Standard (EPS) for new, long term financial commitments for energy resources. The purpose of the EPS was to encourage development of less carbon intensive resources and protect ratepayers from impacts associated with expected future regulatory framework, while at the same time not undermining reliability.

For reporting purposes under AB 32, accuracy is critical, and ignoring the actual emissions factor, and hence emissions, of firming power would undermine this accuracy. Ignoring this distinction in the purposes of the two statutes amounts to a factual error that the Commission should correct in the final decision by requiring firming resources to be assigned their actual emissions value. If the Commission nevertheless decides to attribute to firming resources the emissions value of the associated renewables, then at a minimum it should ensure in R.06-02-012 that any Renewable Energy Credits (RECs) are not unbundled and sold separately for some other purpose. Allowing parties to sell the renewable attributes of such resources would be a form of double-counting.

**C. The DD should reconsider the Southwest regional default emission factor, which is currently set too low.**

The PD incorrectly states that “no party disputes the Joint Staff’s conclusion that the weighted average emissions factor in the Southwest is 1,075 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>e /MWh”, and therefore inappropriately adopts this value as the default emission factor for sales from unspecified sources in the Southwest without providing a rationale for doing so. Joint Staff has adopted a marginal dispatch methodology to determine the resource mix of unspecified imports from the Southwest. The marginal dispatch model shows that 96% of the Southwest imports were natural gas and 4% coal and accordingly calculates the emission factor to be 1,075 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>e /MWh. In its July 2, 2007 comments, the Green Power Institute objected to the use of the marginal dispatch methodology by Joint Staff, from both technical and policy considerations.<sup>4</sup> Calpine also commented on the fact that

---

<sup>4</sup> Comments of the Green Power Institute on the Proposed Joint GHG Reporting Protocol, July 2, 2007 (GPI Comments), p. 7.

the proposed default emission factors are too low.<sup>5</sup> In fact, this proposed default emissions factor is lower than the 1,100 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>e /MWh EPS factor, which is intended to reflect a baseload, combined cycle natural gas turbine (CCGT). In reply comments dated July 10, 2007, both DRA and NRDC supported GPI and Calpine in their assertion that the proposed default emissions factor for the Southwest is too low.<sup>6</sup>

The proposed Southwest default emissions factor of 1,075 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>e/MWh is based on a resource mix of 96% of natural gas and 4% coal. The EPS factor of 1,100 lbs CO<sub>2</sub>e /MWh is based on a 100% natural gas-powered CCGT baseload power plant. The marginal dispatch methodology assumes that the low-cost baseload power plants owned by out-of-state utilities is primarily dispatched to serve their local customers, so that natural gas-fired generation is the primary marginal resource serving peak period demands from California. It seems contradictory that the average emissions from such natural gas-based peaking units are lower than that of a natural-gas powered baseload unit that serves as the proxy under the EPS. Assuming that the marginal dispatch methodology is the appropriate model, the derived emissions factor based on marginal dispatch should be higher than 1,100 lbs/CO<sub>2</sub>e.

GPI recommended a proportional allocation in determining the default emissions factor in its July 2, 2007 comments.<sup>7</sup> DRA agreed that an averaging methodology is more appropriate until a region-wide source-to-sink tracking system is established. Such an averaging methodology would subtract the generation from owned resources or resources under specified contracts from the total generation mix and calculate the average emissions for the remaining unspecified sources. DRA recommends that the Commission adopt this default emission calculation methodology in its final decision.

---

<sup>5</sup> Comments of Calpine Corporation on Joint CPUC and CEC Staff Proposal for an Electricity Retail Provider GHG Reporting Protocol, July 2, 2007, p. 3.

<sup>6</sup> Reply Comments of the Division of Ratepayer Advocates on the Joint California Public Utilities Commission and California Energy Commission Staff Proposal for an Electricity Retail Provider GHG Reporting Protocol, July 10, 2007, pp. 2-4. Reply Comments of the Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC) and Union of Concerned Scientists (UCS) on Joint Staff GHG Reporting Proposal, July 10, 2007, p. 7.

<sup>7</sup> GPI Comments. p. 8.

Joint Staff should provide the calculated value to ARB prior to ARB's adoption of the GHG reporting protocol.

## **II. CONCLUSION**

For the foregoing reasons, DRA recommends that the Commission clarify the PD consistent with these comments.

Respectfully submitted,

DIANA L. LEE  
EDWARD MOLDAVSKY

By: /s/ DIANA L. LEE  
Diana L. Lee  
Staff Counsel

California Public Utilities Commission  
505 Van Ness Avenue  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Phone: (415) 703-4342  
Fax: (415) 703-2262  
E-mail: [dil@cpuc.ca.gov](mailto:dil@cpuc.ca.gov)

August 24, 2007

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have this day served a copy of “**COMMENTS OF THE DIVISION OF RATEPAYER ADVOCATES ON THE PROPOSED INTERIM OPINION ON REPORTING AND TRACKING OF GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IN THE ELECTRICITY SECTOR**” in R.06-04-009.

[ X ] **E-Mail Service:** sending the entire document as an attachment to all known parties of record who provided electronic mail addresses.

[ X ] **U.S. Mail Service:** mailing by first-class mail with postage prepaid to all known parties of record who did not provide electronic mail addresses.

Executed on August 24, 2007 in San Francisco, California.

/s/ ANGELITA MARINDA  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Angelita Marinda

**N O T I C E**

Parties should notify the Process Office, Public Utilities Commission, 505 Van Ness Avenue, Room 2000, San Francisco, CA 94102, of any change of address and/or e-mail address to insure that they continue to receive documents. You must indicate the proceeding number on the service list on which your name appears.

\* \* \* \* \*

## Service List for R.06-04-009

cadams@covantaenergy.com	liddell@energyattorney.com	tomb@crossborderenergy.com	fiji.george@elpaso.com
steven.schleimer@barclayscapital.com	marcie.milner@shell.com	bmcc@mccarthyllaw.com	echiang@elementmarkets.com
steven.huhman@morganstanley.com	rwinthrop@pilotpowergroup.com	sberlin@mccarthyllaw.com	nenbar@energy-insights.com
rick_noger@praxair.com	tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com	anginc@goldrush.com	nlenssen@energy-insights.com
keith.mccrea@sablaw.com	lschavrien@semprautilities.com	joyw@mid.org	bbaker@summitblue.com
ajkatz@mwe.com	GloriaB@anzaelectric.org	jjensen@kirkwood.com	william.tomlinson@elpaso.com
ckrupka@mwe.com	llund@commerceenergy.com	mary.lynych@constellation.com	kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com
lisa.decker@constellation.com	thunt@cecmail.org	lrdevanna-rf@cleanenergysystems.com	phnsk@wecc.biz
cswoollums@midamerican.com	jeanne.sole@sfgov.org	abb@eslawfirm.com	Sandra.ely@state.nm.us
kevin.boudreaux@calpine.com	john.hughes@sce.com	mclaughlin@braunlegal.com	bmcquown@reliant.com
trdill@westernhubs.com	llorenz@semprautilities.com	glw@eslawfirm.com	dbrooks@nevpc.com
ej_wright@oxy.com	marcel@turn.org	jluckhardt@downeybrand.com	anita.hart@swgas.com
pseby@mckennalong.com	nsuetake@turn.org	jdhd@eslawfirm.com	randy.sable@swgas.com
todil@mckennalong.com	dil@cpuc.ca.gov	vwelch@environmentaldefense.org	bill.schrand@swgas.com
steve.koerner@elpaso.com	fjs@cpuc.ca.gov	www@eslawfirm.com	jj.prucnal@swgas.com
jenine.schenk@apses.com	achang@nrdc.org	westgas@aol.com	meridith.strand@swgas.com
jbw@slwplc.com	rsa@a-klaw.com	schohn@smud.org	ckmitchell1@sbcglobal.net
kelly.barr@srpnet.com	ek@a-klaw.com	atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com	chilen@sppc.com
rrtaylor@srpnet.com	kgrenfell@nrdc.org	dansvec@hdo.net	emello@sppc.com
smichel@westernresources.org	mpa@a-klaw.com	notice@psrec.coop	tdillard@sierrapacific.com
roger.montgomery@swgas.com	sls@a-klaw.com	deb@a-klaw.com	dsoyars@sppc.com
ron.deaton@ladwp.com	bill.chen@constellation.com	cynthia.schultz@pacificcorp.com	fluchetti@ndep.nv.gov
snewsom@semprautilities.com	bkc7@pge.com	kyle.l.davis@pacificcorp.com	leilani.johnson@ladwp.com
dhuard@manatt.com	epoole@adplaw.com	ryan.flynn@pacificcorp.com	Lorraine.Paskett@ladwp.com
curtis.kebler@gs.com	agrimaldi@mckennalong.com	carter@ieta.org	randy.howard@ladwp.com
dehling@klng.com	bcragg@goodinmacbride.com	jason.dubchak@niskags.com	robert.pettinato@ladwp.com
gregory.koiser@constellation.com	jsqueri@gmssr.com	bjones@mjb Bradley.com	hyao@semprautilities.com
npedersen@hanmor.com	jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.com	kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.com	rprince@semprautilities.com
mmazur@3phasesRenewables.com	kbowen@winston.com	rapcowart@aol.com	rkeen@manatt.com
tiffany.rau@bp.com	lcottle@winston.com	Kathryn.Wig@nrgenergy.com	nwhang@manatt.com
klatt@energyattorney.com	sbeatty@cwclaw.com	sasteriadis@apx.com	pjazayeri@stroock.com
maureen@lennonassociates.com	vprabhakaran@goodinmacbride.com	george.hopley@barcap.com	derek@climaterestry.org
rhelgeson@scppa.org	jkarp@winston.com	ez@pointcarbon.com	david@nemtzw.com
douglass@energyattorney.com	jeffgray@dwt.com	burtraw@rff.org	harveyederpspc.org@hotmail.com
pssed@adelphia.net	cjw5@pge.com	vb@pointcarbon.com	vitaly.lee@aes.com
akbar.jazayeri@sce.com	ssmyers@att.net	kyle_boudreaux@fpl.com	sendo@ci.pasadena.ca.us
annette.gilliam@sce.com	lars@resource-solutions.org	andrew.bradford@constellation.com	slins@ci.glendale.ca.us
cathy.karlstad@sce.com	alho@pge.com	gbarch@knowledgeinenergy.com	THAMILTON5@CHARTER.NET
Laura.Genao@sce.com	aweller@sel.com	ralph.dennis@constellation.com	bjeider@ci.burbank.ca.us
rkmoore@gswater.com	jchamberlin@strategicenergy.com	smindel@knowledgeinenergy.com	rmorillo@ci.burbank.ca.us
dwood8@cox.net	beth@beth411.com	brabe@umich.edu	roger.pelote@williams.com
amsmith@sempra.com	kerry.hattevik@mirant.com	bpotts@foley.com	aimee.branes@ecosecurities.com
atrial@sempra.com	kowalewskia@calpine.com	james.keating@bp.com	case.admin@sce.com
apak@sempraglobal	wbooth@booth-law.com	jimross@r-c-s-inc.com	tim.hemig@nrgenergy.com
dhecht@sempratrading.com	hoerner@redefiningprogress.org	tcarlson@reliant.com	bjl@bry.com
daking@sempra.com	janill.richards@doj.ca.gov	ghinners@reliant.com	aldyn.hoekstra@paceglobal.com
svongdeuane@semprasolutions.com	mcchen@ucsusa.org	zaiontj@bp.com	ygross@sempraglobal.com
troberts@sempra.com	gmorris@emf.net	julie.martin@bp.com	jlaun@apogee.net

kmkiener@fox.net	JDF1@PGE.COM	kdusel@navigantconsulting.com	edm@cpuc.ca.gov
scottanders@sandiego.edu	sscb@pge.com	gpickering@navigantconsulting.com	cpuc@cpuc.ca.gov
jkloberdanz@semptrautilities.com	svs6@pge.com	lpark@navigantconsulting.com	hym@cpuc.ca.gov
andrew.mcallister@energycenter.org	SL7@pge.com	davidreynolds@ncpa.com	hs1@cpuc.ca.gov
jack.burke@energycenter.org	vjw3@pge.com	scott.tomashefsky@ncpa.com	jm3@cpuc.ca.gov
jennifer.porter@energycenter.org	karla.dailey@cityofpaloalto.org	ewolfe@resero.com	jnm@cpuc.ca.gov
sephra.ninow@energycenter.org	farrokh.albuyeh@oati.net	Audra.Hartmann@Dynergy.com	jbf@cpuc.ca.gov
jleslie@luce.com	greg.blue@sbcglobal.net	Bob.lucas@calobby.com	jk1@cpuc.ca.gov
ofoote@hkcf-law.com	dtibbs@aes4u.com	curt.barry@iwpnews.com	jst@cpuc.ca.gov
ekgrubaugh@iid.com	jhahn@covantaenergy.com	dave@ppallc.com	jtp@cpuc.ca.gov
pepper@cleanpowermarkets.com	andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com	kellie.smith@sen.ca.gov	jol@cpuc.ca.gov
gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com	info@calseia.org	mwaugh@arb.ca.gov	jci@cpuc.ca.gov
mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com	Joe.paul@dynergy.com	pstoner@lgc.org	jf2@cpuc.ca.gov
diane_fellman@fpl.com	monica.schwebs@bingham.com	rachel@ceert.org	krd@cpuc.ca.gov
hayley@turn.org	phanschen@mofo.com	wtasat@arb.ca.gov	lrm@cpuc.ca.gov
mflorio@turn.org	josephhenri@hotmail.com	steven@iepa.com	ltt@cpuc.ca.gov
Dan.adler@calcef.org	pthompson@summitblue.com	etiedemann@kmtg.com	mjd@cpuc.ca.gov
mhyams@sfwater.org	dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net	bushinskyj@pewclimate.org	meg@cpuc.ca.gov
tburke@sfwater.org	Betty.Seto@kema.com	lmh@eslawfirm.com	ner@cpuc.ca.gov
norman.furuta@navy.mil	JerryL@abag.ca.gov	obartho@smud.org	pw1@cpuc.ca.gov
amber@ethree.com	jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net	hteebe@smud.org	psp@cpuc.ca.gov
annabelle.malins@fco.gov.uk	steve@schiller.com	bpurewal@water.ca.gov	pzs@cpuc.ca.gov
dwang@nrdc.org	mrw@mrwassoc.com	dmacmll@water.ca.gov	rmm@cpuc.ca.gov
filings@a-klaw.com	rschmidt@bartlewells.com	kmills@cfbf.com	ram@cpuc.ca.gov
nes@a-klaw.com	adamb@greenlining.org	karen@klindh.com	smk@cpuc.ca.gov
obystrom@cera.com	clyde.murley@comcast.net	ehadley@reupower.com	sgm@cpuc.ca.gov
sdhilton@stoel.com	brenda.lemay@horizonwind.com	Denise_Hill@transalta.com	svn@cpuc.ca.gov
scarter@nrdc.org	carla.peterman@gmail.com	sas@a-klaw.com	scr@cpuc.ca.gov
abonds@thelen.com	elvine@lbl.gov	egw@a-klaw.com	tcx@cpuc.ca.gov
cbaskette@enernoc.com	rhwisner@lbl.gov	akelly@climatetrust.org	ken.alex@doj.ca.gov
colin.petheram@att.com	C_Marnay@lbl.gov	alan.comnes@nrgenergy.com	ken.alex@doj.ca.gov
jwmctarnaghan@duanemorris.com	philml@sedenergy.com	kyle.silon@ecosecurities.com	bdicapo@caiso.com
kfox@wsgr.com	rita@ritanortonconsulting.com	californiadockets@pacificcorp.com	jsanders@caiso.com
kkhoja@thelenreid.com	cpechman@powereconomics.com	Philip.H.Carver@state.or.us	jgill@caiso.com
pvalen@thelen.com	emahlon@ecoact.org	samuel.r.sadler@state.or.us	ppeatingill@caiso.com
spauker@wsgr.com	richards@mid.org	lisa.c.schwartz@state.or.us	mscheibl@arb.ca.gov
rreinhard@mofo.com	chrism@mid.org	cbreidenich@yahoo.com	gottstein@volcano.net
cem@newsdata.com	rogerv@mid.org	dws@r-c-s-inc.com	pburmich@arb.ca.gov
hgolub@nixonpeabody.com	fwmonier@tid.org	jesus.arredondo@nrgenergy.com	bblevins@energy.state.ca.us
jscancarelli@flk.com	brbarkovich@earthlink.net	charlie.blair@delta-ee.com	dmetz@energy.state.ca.us
jwiedman@goodinmacbride.com	johnredding@earthlink.net	karen.mcdonald@powerex.com	deborah.slone@doj.ca.gov
mmattes@nossaman.com	clark.bernier@rlw.com	loe@cpuc.ca.gov	dks@cpuc.ca.gov
jen@cnt.org	rmccann@umich.edu	clarence.binninger@doj.ca.gov	kgiffin@energy.state.ca.us
lisa_weinzimer@platts.com	cmkehrein@ems-ca.com	david.zonana@doj.ca.gov	ldecarlo@energy.state.ca.us
steven@moss.net	e-recipient@caiso.com	agc@cpuc.ca.gov	mprior@energy.state.ca.us
sellis@fypower.org	grosenblum@caiso.com	aeg@cpuc.ca.gov	mgarcia@arb.ca.gov
arno@recurrentenergy.com	rsmutny-jones@caiso.com	blm@cpuc.ca.gov	pduvair@energy.state.ca.us
ELL5@pge.com	saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov	cft@cpuc.ca.gov	wsm@cpuc.ca.gov
gx12@pge.com	david@branchcomb.com	tam@cpuc.ca.gov	hurlock@water.ca.gov
jxa2@pge.com	kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com	dsh@cpuc.ca.gov	hchronin@water.ca.gov



